



CPA UK

Climate Roundtable Series Report

Climate Security

Climate Governance and Devolution

About the Climate Roundtable Series

In December 2021, CPA UK held a series of roundtables in partnership with the FCDO to review the findings of two discussion papers:

1. What Climate Change Means for National and International Security; and
2. Climate Change Governance & the Challenge of Multi-Level Action

The meetings were structured to discuss the report findings, to consider regional climate governance and security contexts, and, in small group discussions, to propose issues and possible actions for Commonwealth parliamentarians to consider.

Summary

About 70% of nations in the world explicitly state that climate change is a national security concern.

The [climate security paper](#), authored by E3G, uses case studies from Nigeria and Bangladesh to illustrate what political prioritisation should look like - from an overview of what the security consequences of climate change actually are, to what should happen next.

Using further case studies across seven Commonwealth countries, the [climate governance paper](#), by GLOBE, provides a considered introduction into how and why climate governance must reflect the multi-level, multi-stakeholder, and collaborative nature of climate change action.

Roundtable participants discussed how actionable and responsive climate change policy can be formulated, implemented, and monitored within their respective systems of governance.

Participants welcomed the discussion papers, and there was widespread agreement with their findings.

Climate Security Roundtable

Speakers



St Lucia

Senator Hon. Guibion Ferdinand



Scotland

Sarah Boyack MSP



Canada

Kristina Michaud, MP



Kiribati

Hon. Pinto Katia
Hon. Dr. Kautu Tenaua



Seychelles

Hon. Waven William

Main Points from Speakers

Participants were asked to share examples of how climate change is a risk to national security and a driver of conflict in their country or region.



Kiribati

Hon. Dr. Kautu
Tenaua

Kiribati is one of the most vulnerable nations to be affected by climate change. In the early 1960s and 70s the sound of the waves and wind was minimal. In the present day, there are considerable increases in coastal erosion and related destruction of the island. This is a big threat to the livelihood, with land already lost on the coral atoll. The beach is also essential to the Kiribati way of life, from fishing to soaking coconut husks for making strings etc. Transportation of essential goods is further being disrupted, resulting in food shortages in the islands surrounding the mainland. The population does not want to leave the island, but is experiencing forced displacement as a result of these challenges.



Seychelles

Hon. Waven
William

Seychelles is a small island state with low lying islands. Most of the development is focused on the coast. Climate change will have great impacts on security in terms of infrastructure, the fish industry and fish stock, the tourism industry, pests and a rise in diseases such as dengue fever.

Saint Lucia, like Seychelles, is also a Small Independent Developing State (SIDS). We are completely surrounded by water, which makes us extremely vulnerable. On the Eastern side of the island, hurricanes are the major threat – one hurricane can wipe out the entire GDP of the country. In December 2010, outside the usual wet season, the country experienced a major trough of rainfall which wiped out the main road connecting the North to the South. It takes a decade to rebuild after a single climatic event. We no longer have reliable dry and wet seasons. Rainfall is now unpredictable, meaning tourism, water access, agriculture and fisheries are all affected.



St Lucia

Senator Hon. Guibion Ferdinand



Scotland is a devolved legislature, therefore it doesn't have responsibility over the army or navy, but we do rely on armed forces for security events. We are yet to see any climate related emergencies for which we have had to rely on armed forces. The Government is currently focused on what Scotland can do to support other countries – climate security has not been as high on the agenda compared to setting and delivering targets.



Scotland

Sarah Boyack MSP

Canada is already affected by climate change. According to some reports, Northern Canada is warming at more than double the global average. There is an increased frequency of extreme weather conditions, including wildfires and floods. The Canadian Armed Forces have been called upon to help with climate related events and were deployed at least 7 times in 2021. Lieutenant Generals are starting to question if they are prepared as these events increase in frequency.

Canada

Kristina Michaud, MP



Participants were asked whether existing legislation provides sufficient protection for citizens against climate security impacts.



Kiribati

Hon. Dr. Kautu
Tenaua

The social benefit has drawbacks, as it is only available to 18–59 year-olds and therefore does not support the livelihoods of 5–17 year-olds, including school fees etc. There is still a pressing need for targeted climate action such as sea water reinforcements, fresh water supply for the islands, repair for transport links, and more frequent shipping for essential goods and food.



Kiribati

Hon. Pinto Katia

There are some government projects raised by MPs which are providing a level of protection for citizens against climate security impacts. For example, the provision of desalination plants to about 10 islands due to the shortages of water. A social benefit was introduced in 2019, costing \$15 million (AUD) / \$50 (AUD) per month. The elderly receive \$200 (AUD) per month. So there are a few social benefits, but on climate resilience, not as much targeted effort.



St Lucia

Senator Hon.
Guibion Ferdinand

Saint Lucia is striking a balance between legislating on this matter and thinking about the bigger picture. There is a conflict between immediate needs and sustainable long-term needs. We cannot commit 20% of the budget on the environment but leave the population without basic food supplies during COVID-19. One example is our drive-in volcano. It is a major tourist destination but also a major source of renewable energy. By using this resource for energy, we are compromising our ability to receive foreign exchange. This is the sort of balance we must strike as a country when making decisions. These are some of the decisions and implications we must balance as legislators.



Canada

Kristina Michaud
MP

Canada is heading in the right direction, but it is not doing enough. Canada will be implementing its National Adaptation Strategy and investing 3 billion over a period of 3 years. While this seems like a large sum of money, the damage from the floods in British Columbia will require a significant number of resources to reconstruct. We have an effective strategy for renewable energy in Quebec, so this could be a model to explore for the rest of Canada and the rest of the world. The responsibility is greater for countries like Canada to do more to help others.



Scotland

Sarah Boyack
MSP

We have invested into wave and tidal power to see what works. This has been a challenge as we have deep seas around Scotland which have rough waters. However, we have managed to get the technology to work. Another successful initiative has been around onshore and offshore wind power. There has been a huge expansion of this over the last 10 years in Scotland. We are now expanding into solar power in our towns, although this comes with a greater expense than what we have done before. In the next 3 years, all new houses will have to fit new standards and will not be allowed gas systems.

Participants were asked to discuss climate security as a political priority at the highest level of government and its institutions in their legislatures.



Scotland

Sarah Boyack
MSP

Scotland is not focused on its own climate security but rather about our responsibility and obligations as one of the countries that led on the industrial revolution and produced historical emissions. The current security focus is around global health. We are learning from the experience of the global pandemic and how it has impacted everyday life. Tourism has been hugely affected here and our economy is largely dependent on it.



Canada

Kristina Michaud
MP

Canada is trying to focus on its responsibility to others, but Canada is still a fossil fuel producer and user. Canada has never achieved its greenhouse emission targets. In fact, emissions increased from 1990, rather than reduced. Having targets is a big focus, but the Environment Minister does not have the same powers to ensure these are achieved as the Finance Minister, for example. Canada has adopted a national adaptation strategy, so there is a political will to do more.



Seychelles

Hon. Waven
William

Climate security is being considered. When you look at what is happening globally, especially for SIDS, it is becoming a priority. It also depends on how leaders are able to negotiate conflicting priorities in terms of addressing COVID-19 in the short-term, and the impacts of climate change in the long-term. SIDS are not contributing to global emissions. The question is how we are able to strategize for mitigation and adaptation. However, with a lack of resources, the question is also how big polluters can come in to assist the smaller countries who are most effected.



St Lucia

Senator Hon.
Guibion Ferdinand

Saint Lucia is also largely dependent on tourism. The entire eastern Caribbean is not responsible for even 1% of carbon emissions. We often feel that we are not the ones guilty of creating the problem, but we are the ones feeling the worst effects. Our topography means that we are also very reliant on agriculture, yet storage facilities for water and food are impacted and land slippage is also a threat. The current focus is therefore on how we can build resilience against these threats.



Kiribati

Hon. Pinto Katia

The former government, from 2012-2015, prioritised climate change and engaged with youth and religious communities on this issue. The current government, since 2016, has not demonstrated the same commitments. Instead they are focusing on increasing revenue and gaining support for re-election. The present government is waiting for assistance from developed countries and embracing the need for more developed countries to assist by contributing financially and technologically to develop the resilience needed for climate change.

Participants were asked to consider what challenges their legislature has faced in legislating for climate security and how can these be overcome.

The contribution from Seychelles speaks to what is happening in Saint Lucia. We have a programme called the Disaster Vulnerability Reduction Programme, aimed at identifying projects which can help reduce disaster risks. However, because decisions are mainly being taken at the executive level, we have no parliamentary approval on where funds are being spent or what is deemed to be a risk reduction project. It is very important that parliament gets a bigger say on what happens with the resources and the decisions that relate to disaster reduction.



St Lucia

Senator Hon. Guibion Ferdinand



A key challenge is around the governance system. Legislators are often not included in the legislative process when the executive makes decisions. As a result, oversight and accountability is lost. Climate security legislation would be more effective if parliamentarians had greater involvement, we are representatives of the people and should have the opportunity to legislate in their interests.



Seychelles

Hon. Waven William



Canada

Kristina Michaud
MP

The Canadian net-zero emissions legislation was passed last June and there is now a climate Bill concentrating on the goals for 2050 being carbon neutral. There are ambitious targets contained within this Bill, yet producers of oil and gas are saying that production will increase until 2045. The greatest challenge is therefore how to transform the economy when GDP is coming from oil and gas.



Kiribati

Hon. Dr. Kautu
Tenaua

A key challenge is around how money is used to encourage voting in elections. The population is not electing governments who are committing to spending money on climate change rather than social benefits. Environmental organisations and advocacy groups would be beneficial to members by providing scientific evidence, updating members on the effects of climate change, and advising them on how Kiribati could be setting goals with scientific backing. This evidence would encourage the government and the population to act.



Scotland

Sarah Boyack
MSP

The major challenge we have politically is how to make our transition to zero emissions equal and fair. We have many members of the population who have lower incomes and do not have the capacity to make the change. 1 in 4 homes live in fuel poverty, and gas remains the cheapest way to heat our homes. While our targets are radical, reaching net zero by 2045, the challenge is the transition. We have to make sure our own citizens don't get left behind, while ensuring we are also contributing to supporting citizens across the world who are facing the immediate effects. We also face a challenge in that many of our population do not view themselves as vulnerable in the same way as other nations facing the immediate effects. In our communities there is a need to persuade people that it is a pressing issue which needs to be addressed and that we also have a responsibility to act on behalf of others. Working cross-party is key to tackling this, so as to ensure climate is not viewed as a politically partisan agenda.

Participants were asked to share examples of legislation from their jurisdiction that improve resilience and adaptation.



Kiribati

Hon. Pinto Katia

Kiribati reviewed and updated its Joint Implementation Plan for Climate Change and Disaster Risk Management in 2019. This is a holistic plan on climate actions that prioritises 104 climate action and disaster risk reduction actions. The focus now needs to be on renewable energy. We currently spend millions of dollars on fossil fuels. If we are very serious about mitigating climate change, we should be more committed in terms of a renewable energy. Kiribati has very strong winds and plenty of sunshine, this could be more than enough to eliminate our dependence on fossil fuels.



Scotland

Sarah Boyack
MSP

Scotland has implemented two pieces of legislation relating to climate change, one in 2009 and one in 2019. They were both seen as world leading because they were more radical than other legislatures were considering at the time. There was conflict between political parties in terms of who could be seen as most 'climate friendly' while creating jobs. However, both Acts were passed with crucial cross-party support. Our challenge is to now deliver on the transition and further gain cross-party support on how we implement our agreed targets.



Canada

Kristina Michaud
MP

Canada added 1.3 billion dollars to the Disaster and Adaptation Mitigation Fund, with a minimum of 138 million dollars that would go to indigenous recipients. It is an important indicator that Canada is prioritising those communities who are most vulnerable to climate related disasters. Canada is heading in the right direction, we can see a desire from all parliamentarians of all parties to do more to fight climate change. We also have an unofficial environmental committee that is cross-party and works together without the usual party-political divides, and these meetings have been highly effective in providing a forum for Members to discuss challenges and solutions.



Seychelles

Hon. Waven
William

For the first time, the Parliament of Seychelles will be establishing a Committee which is responsible for scrutinising the Ministry of Agriculture, Climate Change and Environment on all aspects of its work relating to the environment, climate change, energy, island development, agriculture and so on. This represents a major step towards ensuring legislators can fulfil their roles in holding the government to account and advocating for more effective environmental legislation and policy.

Climate Governance and Devolution Roundtable

Speakers



Northern Ireland

Dr Steve Aiken OBE MLA



Australia (ACT & NT)

Ms Elizabeth Lee MLA
Mr Joel Bowden MLA



Gibraltar

Hon. Steven Linares MP



Malaysia

Hon. Noor Amin Ahmad



Pakistan

Hon. Naveed Qamar



Canada (Manitoba & National)

Hon. Sarah Guillemard
Terry Duguid, MP

Main Points from Speakers

Participants were asked to share examples of how and at what level climate change is governed in their legislature/nation.



Canada (Manitoba)
Hon. Sarah Guillemard

From a provincial perspective, the governance structure for our climate change action is framed by Canada's constitutional framework. Under our constitution, neither the federal government nor the provinces have clear jurisdiction over climate action. The shared responsibility is what we are currently trying to navigate, also in terms of how we can work together to ensure efforts are not unnecessarily duplicated. Manitoba enacted a Climate and Green Plan which focuses on four pillars - climate, jobs, water and nature – recognising action on climate is necessary but there is also an economic cost which needs to be mitigated.



Australia
Mr Joel Bowden MLA

The Northern Territory has only one House and is a very small jurisdiction, with only about 250,000 people over 1.5 million square kilometres. The NT government has made commitments to a long-term target of net zero by 2050. The area is very solar rich, so the government has invested in related technologies, including a 20-billion-dollar sun cable, aiming to capture solar and supply power to Singapore.

Canada's parliamentary system has been inherited from the UK system, and the provinces have jurisdiction for their own natural resources. While there is shared jurisdiction over the environment, the federal government is responsible for setting National Determined Contributions (NDCs) and related climate targets. This has proved to be a challenge as Canada is a major producer and exporter of oil and gas. There are a number of mechanisms we have used to engage the provinces in meeting targets, such as the Pan-Canadian Climate Framework which 11 out of 13 provinces have signed onto. The Net Zero Emissions Accountability Act was passed by the federal government in 2021, which commits Canada to a 40-45% reduction by 2030 and net zero by 2050. Canada's strengthened climate plan – A Healthy Environment and A Healthy Economy – also sets out actions the Government will be taking to achieve this.



Canada (National)
Terry Duguid, MP



Pakistan
Hon. Naveed Qamar

Pakistan previously had a central Ministry of Environment, until 2010, when 12 sweeping constitutional reforms took place. The federal government enacted the 18th amendment to the constitution which gave provinces Ministries of Environment, Health and Education. The Ministry for Climate Change, however, sits with the federal government. Issues related to air and air quality are the subject of provinces and states, whereas the controlling of floods is dealt with by the federal government.



Malaysia

Hon. Noor Amin
Ahmad

Malaysia is a federation with 15 states and 3 territories, divided by federal and state governments. In 2009, the government established a national policy on climate change, which falls under the Ministry of Environment and Water. Other Ministries are related to climate, including the Ministry of Energy and Energy Resources. However, some states are developmentally lacking and the priority for the government is to urbanise rather than prevent climate change.



Australia

Ms Elizabeth Lee
MLA

The Australian Capital Territory is a very small geographic area with a population of 430,000. The ACT has a unicameral legislature, with just 35 members and a unique Hare-Clark system [1]. However, it has been proven that lots of positive work can be done at the sub-national level. The ACT has been progressive and forward thinking in this area, setting a target of 100% renewable energy by 2045 and by procuring the amount of energy that is actually spent. This is due to a willingness for Members of the ACT to embody a cross-party approach to climate change and to work together to find solutions to climate threats.



Northern Ireland

Dr Steve Aiken
OBE MLA

Northern Ireland is starting from a low baseline and does not currently have any climate legislation in place. We have two related Bills proceeding in front of our Assembly, aiming to bring climate emergency legislation forward, although there is some dispute over the form this legislation should take. We are currently looking at best practice across Wales and Scotland, and Europe and the Commonwealth more broadly. There is agreement we need an independent process and members are pushing for an independent commissioner to hold the government accountable. Action needs to be taken now - Northern Ireland should not be seen as an outlier in acting on the climate.



Gibraltar

Hon. Steven
Linares MP

Gibraltar enacted climate change legislation in 2019 which stated the degrees in temperate needed to reach targets, and a motion was passed in parliament which declared a climate emergency. The Minister also established a committee of stakeholders, including non-governmental organisations and environmental groups, to provide a forum to inform and advise the Government on climate action. The government has been taking forward a 'whole of society' and non-partisan approach to the climate emergency.

[1] A type of single transferable vote system of proportional representation.

Participants were asked how sub-national legislatures can encourage more responsive action to climate change at the national level.



Pakistan

Hon. Naveed
Qamar

We push for issues through our political party. If the party is pursuing a policy this means it is done at both levels, and sometimes party members at the sub-national level push harder. However, there are challenges. Progress can rarely be made without cross-party support. Furthermore, while climate is discussed at both the federal and state level, it is concentrated with the federal government. There are also challenges with resources at the sub-national level. Finance is the driving force in climate action and many sub-national legislatures do not have the necessary budget.



Australia

Ms Elizabeth Lee
MLA

Significant progress has been made by the States and Territories of Australia through sub-national collaboration. For example, New South Wales, South Australia, and the ACT recently announced a commitment to a net zero emissions policy forum, designed to support each other in working towards reaching net zero. Working cross-party and across jurisdictions is key – sub-national legislatures have a vital role to play in representing the needs and desires of the state electorates.



Northern Ireland

Dr Steve Aiken
OBE MLA

In Northern Ireland we are working closely with the other sub-national legislatures – Scotland and Wales – to establish a common approach. Unusually, the national government is ahead of Northern Ireland and the other sub-national legislatures are similarly lagging behind. This produces an unusual tension in which the sub-nationals are advocating for further action from the national government while they are behind. The headline goals that the UK Government is pushing following COP26 are far ahead of what we can achieve currently.



Canada

(Manitoba)
Hon. Sarah
Guillemard

The easiest way for sub-national legislatures to ensure success is through collaboration. The strong-arm approach of federal governments, exemplified by unilaterally applying policies and targets, has not been helpful. In Canada, a one size fits all approach does not work across all provinces. Climate action must be informed by the local concerns and specific challenges to the area. Sub-national legislatures must work together to advocate for local solutions with a cumulative effect - particularly when some legislatures are slower than others due to local challenges. The Pan-Canadian Climate Framework is one forum which allows sub-national legislatures to discuss these concerns and encourage dialogue with the federal government.

Participants were asked how they make the most of their governance structure to encourage action, including what obstacles there are and how these can be overcome.

Aiming to break down climate action into very small and non-intimidating approaches has been key. When you have multiple people contributing at different levels, many small actions can constitute significant progress. It also starts with one-on-one conversations that facilitate learning and build momentum around policy aims. Forming personal relationships and taking a collaborative approach is key to bringing everyone on board, particularly industries who would traditionally be considered resistant to climate action.

There are challenges with the Northern Ireland set up. Previously, as unionists, we would never have been seen as taking a stance on green issues such as climate change. I have been pushing the net zero approach at a political cost because there has been a degree of push back from traditionalists. It has been a journey of building political support through my own party and galvanising an often-conservative wider community to see the opportunities net zero presents. Rather than looking inwards, which is often the case with regional parliaments focusing on the local, we are now encouraging members to look outwards at the wider issues impacting the globe.



Canada (Manitoba)
Hon. Sarah Guillemard



Northern Ireland
Dr Steve Aiken OBE MLA



The population of the Northern Territory (NT) is largely indigenous, who have disproportionately lower levels of health and education. A key obstacle is how to find and allocate enough money to support people who are disadvantaged in this way. The NT budget is just under \$7 billion (AUD) - \$2 billion (AUD) goes to health and \$1B goes to education. There is a sheer lack of finance to focus on climate action. One potential solution is seeking private investors who possess the finance and are willing to provide help, as part of a 'whole of society' approach to tackling the issue which enables the sub-national to overcome budgetary concerns.



Australia (NT)

Mr Joel Bowden MLA



Steven Linares



Joel Bowden



Noor Amin

On an individual level, I use solar panels in my home and produce my own electricity. Due to my low levels of consumption, I pay back into the grid credits of electricity. However, the credits I produce are not recognised on a system, reflecting a wider concern from constituents that if they make an investment in solar panels, they will not receive a benefit. I have been advocating the government for the implementation of this system to encourage individuals to invest in these technologies. It's a small community initiative, but it's leading by example to encourage individuals to make similarly sustainable choices.



Gibraltar

Hon. Steven Linares MP

There are many obstacles to shift and Malaysia can only take small steps as a developing and oil dependent country. We have sought to reduce dependence on oil over the past 10 years and reliance has decreased by 50%. The money is being used to invest in other green operations. The government has also established a solar panels subsidy for lower income people to go onto the national grid, enabling those with lower incomes to adapt to climate effectives.



Malaysia

Hon. Noor Amin Ahmad

Participants were asked to share one positive example of legislation from their jurisdiction that improves climate resilience and adaptation.



Malaysia

Hon. Noor Amin
Ahmad

In terms of renewable energy, we have set a target to achieve 50% renewable energy by 2035. In terms of the manufacturing sector, we are giving incentives to small and medium enterprises to implement green manufacturing processes, aiming for about 30% in the next 10 years. In the next 20 years, we are targeting about half of industry to be green players and participating in the green economy.



Australia

Ms Elizabeth Lee
MLA

In the efforts to reach 100% clean energy, legislation was passed to conduct reverse auctions for clean power, such as wind and solar farms. While it has some drawbacks related to price lock ins, at the time this legislation was innovative and has served as good practice for other nations in terms of how they can work towards similar targets. The spirit of sub-national legislatures working together in the tri-partisan approach to climate policy has been key to enabling legislative progress to improve climate resilience and adaptation.



Northern Ireland

Dr Steve Aiken
OBE MLA

In the next 4-5 years we will see climate emergency related legislation brought to the Northern Ireland Assembly. This means the emphasis on dealing with the climate emergency will be central to the next government and front and centre of everybody's political agenda.



Canada (National)

Terry Duguid
MP

We committed to establishing a Canada Water Agency, bringing together provinces, territories, indigenous governments and other stakeholders together to solve water problems collaboratively. In the federal government alone, there are 26 agencies which have some level of responsibility over water. The Canada Water Agency aims to coordinate and convene efforts to produce solutions for preserving water and mitigating the impact of climate change.





COMMONWEALTH
PARLIAMENTARY
ASSOCIATION UK 

CPA UK

Westminster Hall | Houses of Parliament | London | SW1A 0AA

T: +44 (0)207 219 5373

W: www.uk-cpa.org

E: cpauk@parliament.uk