COMMONWEALTH ASSOCIATION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEES
CAPAC REGIONAL WORKSHOP SERIES FINAL REPORT
OUTCOME & OUTPUTS

1. PAC Chairs, members, and clerks will have enhanced technical skills and improved capacity to scrutinise and hold government to account
2. Participants will have strengthened their networks and built further contacts in the region
3. The CAPAC online portal will reflect the needs of Commonwealth PACs and have the relevant resources available

KEY DELIVERABLES

1. A full Workshop report to be distributed to all delegates
2. Further materials for the CAPAC Online Portal
3. Validation of the biennial PAC survey
Between 2018 – 2020, CPA UK led four CAPAC Regional Workshops for PAC Chairs, members and clerks across the Commonwealth.

- Pacific Regional Workshop – engaged with 36 delegates from 12 PACs. Hosted by the Parliament of Fiji between 19 – 21 February 2019;
- Asia Regional Workshop – engaged with 25 delegates from 6 PACs. Hosted by the Parliament of Malaysia between 1 – 3 August 2019;

The Africa Regional Workshop was developed and funded by CPA UK as a ‘pilot’ workshop for the subsequent series of workshops, which were funded by the UK Government through the Commonwealth Partnership for Democracy (CP4D) programme.

The outputs of each Regional Workshop were:

- PAC Chairs, members and clerks will have enhanced technical skills and improved capacity to scrutinise and hold government to account;
- Participants will have strengthened their networks and built further contacts in the region;
- The CAPAC Online Portal will reflect the needs of PACs and have the relevant resources available.

Each Regional Workshop explored a diverse range of themes, but common topics included: public engagement and working with the media; effective questioning techniques; building consensus; and blockers and enablers for PAC work.

Enablers and Blockers in Public Accounts Committees

Every PAC or equivalent committee participating in a CAPAC Regional Workshop was requested to complete the Public Accounts Committee Biennial Survey ahead of the Workshop. This survey, produced and monitored by CPA UK, asks PACs to rate themselves against a series of 9 principles (see pages 13 - 19 for more information). Using the results of the Biennial Survey as a starting point for discussion, delegates explored the ‘enablers’ which help or support PACs in being fully compliant and the ‘blockers’ which prevent PACs from fully complying with principles.

As expected, the enablers and blockers varied depending on the PAC and the region, however a range of common blockers and enablers were identified by PACs across the Commonwealth:

Blockers:
- Resource issues: insufficient staffing or budgets to support PAC work;
- Further training needed for members to scrutinise financial statements/info;
- Challenges to achieve quorum for PAC meetings;
- Backlog of audit reports;
- Lack of PAC independence from Government;
- Confirming witness attendance/getting adequate responses to questioning;
- Independence and neutrality of PAC members;
- Limited access to government reports and records;
- Translation and language barriers;
- Limited time resources for members.

Enablers:
- Bipartisan approaches to achieving consensus and working together;
- Hard working staff;
- Proactive media coverage;
- Independence of the PAC budget;
- Witnesses compelled to attend hearings;
- Follow up mechanisms with the government;
- Status of, and respect for, the PAC.

These discussions framed their objectives for implementing changes to strengthen financial oversight and scrutiny when they returned to their PACs following the Workshops.
**Effective Questioning Techniques**

Exchanging knowledge and experience to strengthen questioning techniques was a key activity at each Regional Workshop. Alongside technical training to strengthen questioning techniques, all delegates took part in interactive committee exercises to put their training into practice. These exercises used real-life PAC inquiries to explore different techniques of scrutiny which can be implemented during an inquiry process.

Common feedback shared with delegates during each regional Workshop’s committee inquiry included:

- Ask more questions to ensure you have all the information you need – do not necessarily accept ‘yes’ or ‘no’ answers from a witness;
- Rephrase questions to make them as short and direct as possible, so that witnesses understand and can give an accurate and helpful answer;
- Focus attention on both witnesses;
- Follow a line of questioning on one topic before moving on to the next theme or focus;
- Chairs need to manage questions being asked by members, which encourages a less political working environment and helps build consensus.

**Building Consensus**

The challenge of building consensus and maintaining political neutrality in PAC work was a consistent theme discussed during the CAPAC Regional Workshops. It was a particular issue for PACs from small legislatures, where PAC members could also have roles as government ministers. This created challenges for political neutrality and the time that the individual could dedicate to PAC work, particularly to committee hearings.

Delegates in the Regional Workshops discussed different approaches to building consensus, including:

- Questioning styles – encouraging PAC members from different political parties to work together to question a witness;
- PAC Chair – the Chair has a key role to play in building consensus by working closely with PAC members to encourage them to work collaboratively and understanding their areas of interest.

**Public Engagement and Working with the Media**

Developing successful media and public engagement strategies was a recurrent theme during the Regional Workshops. Delegates discussed the ability of strong media strategies to amplify key messages from the PAC and increase the impact of recommendations. Many delegates discussed the important potential that the media has for engaging with the public. A good relationship with the media was seen as a huge ‘enabler’ for legislatures as the media can often be a great tool to strengthen a committee’s position. The media can be successful in encouraging witnesses to attend committee hearings by highlighting specific issues in the public realm and putting pressure on individuals to attend in order to best serve the public interest. The media was also seen as a good way to amplify the committee's messages and raise public awareness of its work.

Through interactive activities, members exchanged good practice for effective public speaking, delivering key messages and creating concise content for social media. This included writing a short speech and delivering it in a 30-second film, before receiving feedback from their peers.

Clerks shared experience of writing press releases and drafting content for social media and broadcast. They also shared different examples of media content plans to create strong media and engagement strategies.
Delegates from the UK attended all four regional Workshops. The UK PAC has been counted just once in the overall engagement with PACs figure. 7 different UK delegates attended the regional Workshops. Representation at the regional Workshops from the UK included:

**AFRICA**
- 16 males
- 11 females
- 1 member
- 1 clerk

**PACIFIC**
- 28 males
- 8 females
- 17 clerks
- 19 members
- 16 males
- 15 females
- 10 clerks
- 1 member
- 1 clerk

**ASIA**
- 25 delegates
- 16 members
- 9 clerks
- Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia
- 16 females
- 20 males
- 9 clerks
- 16 members
- 10 clerks
- 1 member
- 1 clerk
- August 2019

**CARIBBEAN**
- 31 delegates
- 22 members
- 9 clerks
- Port of Spain, Trinidad and Tobago
- 15 females
- 16 males
- 9 clerks
- 22 members
- 8 clerks
- 1 member
- 1 clerk
- January 2020

Delegates from the UK attended all four regional Workshops. The UK PAC has been counted just once in the overall engagement with PACs figure. 7 different UK delegates attended the regional Workshops. Representation at the regional Workshops from the UK included:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Size of Committee</th>
<th>CAPAC Member</th>
<th>Gov't Expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>British Virgin Islands</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$400 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montserrat</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$47.04 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belize</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$572 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grenada</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$7.466 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trinidad &amp; Tobago</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$464.4 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$846.4 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$846.4 million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$1.164 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>$3.038 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>$1.567 billion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COMMONWEALTH ASSOCIATION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEES (CAPAC)

The Commonwealth Association of Public Accounts Committees (CAPAC) was founded in June 2015 with the aim of ensuring that all Commonwealth Parliaments and the citizens they serve benefit from strong and independent Public Accounts or equivalent committees to sustain and promote the highest principles of public finance.

The foundation of CAPAC was welcomed by Commonwealth Heads of Government at a meeting in Malta in November 2015 as ‘a network for strengthening public financial management and accountability, these being vital in maintaining the trust of citizens and the integrity of governments and legislatures.’

Among CAPAC’s key functions is ‘Defining, publishing and promoting standards of good practice, in line with Commonwealth principles, to assist CAPAC Member Committees in being effective, transparent and independent.’ In pursuit of this, CAPAC established a Standards Working Group, responsible for setting and promoting a Commonwealth Standard for PAC Practice.

This will assist PACs by making clear, not only for committees themselves, but for parliaments and governments, what is good practice in relation to Commonwealth PACs. This Commonwealth Standard should cover the regulations – legislation, standing orders or other guidelines or handbooks – which govern the operations of PACs, the resources provided for them and the quality of response to PACs by ministries, especially the implementation of PAC recommendations.

CAPAC also aims to set some standards which should be observed by Supreme Audit Institutions in their relations with PACs. This includes timely production and tabling of audit and value-for-money reports, and, where appropriate, effective support for PAC inquiries. The Working Group outlined a number of CAPAC Principles, which were adopted in London in December 2017.

Almost 40 committees have now joined CAPAC. Commonwealth Public Accounts Committees (or equivalent) who have not yet joined are encouraged to do so.

Please contact cpa.uk@parliament.uk to find out more information about how to join.

COMMONWEALTH PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE ONLINE PORTAL

At each Regional Workshop, delegates learned about the Commonwealth Public Accounts Committee Online Portal, a learning hub for members and clerks on Public Accounts Committees across the Commonwealth.

As part of CPA UK’s work for the Commonwealth Partnership for Democracy (CP4D), we have developed this online tool to promote cross-Commonwealth learning on topical issues in public financial management and government scrutiny.

This portal will also serve as a platform for engagement, where users can easily post or follow topics of discussion on PAC-related content, such as procedural questions or tips for interacting with witnesses.

We welcome your feedback on how members or clerks of Public Accounts Committees might use or benefit from this online tool. Please email us with any constructive ideas for further development of the portal.

If you have useful articles or content to add to the Online Portal for colleagues across the Commonwealth to use in their PAC work, please contact the CPA UK Team to add it to the portal. Please email cpa.uk@parliament.uk.
COMMONWEALTH PAC BIENNIAL SURVEY

The Public Accounts Committee Biennial Survey

In advance of the CAPAC Regional Workshops held between 2018 - 2020, CPA UK asked for PACs participating in the Workshops to complete the Public Accounts Committee Biennial Survey.

The data collected will feed into the development of programme and the content of these forms are confidential and will be used and stored for internal CPA UK monitoring and evaluation purposes. Only non-attributed data will be extracted for external use.

Country ……………………………………………. Form completed by (name and role)…………………………………….

Section 1: Below is a list of principles for Public Accounts Committees drawn from the CPA Recommended Benchmarks for Democratic Legislatures and the Commonwealth Association of PACs Principles, please rate your PAC against each Principle.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAC Principles and Benchmarks</th>
<th>No plans to be compliant</th>
<th>Rarely compliant</th>
<th>Plans to be compliant</th>
<th>Mostly compliant</th>
<th>Fully compliant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. A PAC should operate independently of government direction. The PAC's independence should be outlined clearly through the provisions of the Standing Orders.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. PACs should have an adequate budget to cover their personnel and other operational costs, training and capacity building costs, as well as costs associated with hearings, publication of reports and sourcing external advice.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A PAC needs non-partisan and skilled support staff. At a minimum, a PAC should have a Clerk and research staff.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. A PAC should encourage public involvement and media coverage. Committee hearings should be open to the media and the interested public, and any exceptions from this rule need to be reasonably justified.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. PAC members should have a common understanding and articulation of the PAC's mandate, roles and powers. Members should have a good understanding of how PAC powers should be applied.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. A PAC shall have access to all records, in whatever form, to be able to scrutinise the Executive and perform the necessary oversight of public spending.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. A PAC should have the power to summon persons, papers and records, and this power shall extend to witnesses and evidence from the executive branch, including officials.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. PACs should produce a summary report of its overall findings and the extent to which its recommendations have been implemented that should lead to a debate in parliament.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. PACs need to ensure that there are robust arrangements in place to follow up their recommendations, including timelines. Such follow up may be carried out by the Supreme Audit Institution and/or the Ministry of Finance/entities concerned. However, where the PAC finds that government bodies have been slow in implementing recommendations then the senior officials of these bodies should be summoned to appear before the Committee to explain themselves.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Section 2

1. Total number of members of your PAC___________

Number of Government members:_______ Opposition_______ Male_______ Female_______

2. How many inquiries has your PAC held in the last 12 months? ________________focusing on which areas: __________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

3. How many reports has your PAC completed in the last 12 months?_____________________________

4. What methods do you use to collect evidence and data for inquiries?

5. How satisfied are you by the Government response to your inquiries (please circle one)?

6. What do you see as the biggest challenges facing the PAC?

7. Which technical skills will your PAC prioritise to develop?

8. How effective is your working relationship with the Supreme Audit Institution (please circle one)?

9. What expertise does your PAC have that can be shared with other PACs?

10. Could you provide a case study of a key achievement of your PAC. Please include the context/challenge, the approach your PAC took, the results and lessons learned.
AFRICA REGIONAL SURVEY RESULTS

The Africa Regional Workshop in August 2018 was a pilot Workshop developed and funded by CPA UK to share learning, challenges and best practice. It was the first Regional Workshop in which the biennial survey was completed by 11 PACs from national parliaments and 1 subnational parliament.

Self-rating against PAC Principles

The first set of results shown for each region is the PAC’s self-rating against the 9 PAC principles. The size of the circle represents the number of PACs that self-rated against that principle. Therefore, the larger the circle, the more PACs self-rated against that principle.

PAC Relationships

The survey asked two specific questions to better understand a PAC’s relationship with two of its key stakeholders, the government and the Supreme Audit Institution:

• How satisfied are PACs with the government response to inquiries?
• How effective is the working relationship with the Supreme Audit Institution

Breakdown of PAC Members

PACs were asked for the gender breakdown of their PAC. The results are presented as a regional percentage.

Key Challenges faced by Public Accounts Committees in Africa

• Inadequate resources: budget, time, human;
• Lack of independence from government and complete neutrality;
• Ineffective communication strategies, and weak relationships with key stakeholders, including the media.
PACIFIC REGIONAL SURVEY RESULTS

The Pacific Regional Workshop in February 2019 was the second Regional Workshop to share learning, challenges and best practices. It included 12 Public Account Committees from across the region including PACs from the Pacific Islands, Australian Territories and New Zealand.

Self-Ratings against PAC Principles

Key Challenges faced by Public Accounts Committees in the Pacific

- Adequate technical support and capacity building for staff and members;
- Uncertainty over whether government will respond to recommendations;
- Delay of government responses;
- Time commitment of members;
- Independence from the executive & overreliance on government institutions for evidence.

PAC Relationships

How satisfied are PACs with the government response to inquiries?

How effective is the working relationship with the Supreme Audit Institution?

ASIA REGIONAL SURVEY RESULTS

The Asia Regional Workshop in August 2019 was the third Regional Workshop to share learning, challenges and best practices. It included 6 Public Account Committees from across the region. 7 PACs completed the survey in advance of the Workshop.

Key Challenges faced by Public Accounts Committees in Asia

- Increasingly technical inquiries which require more information;
- Utilising social media effectively;
- A backlog of reports from the Auditor General;
- Time commitment of members.

PAC Relationships

How satisfied are PACs with the government response to inquiries?

How effective is the working relationship with the Supreme Audit Institution?
CARIBBEAN REGIONAL SURVEY RESULTS

The Caribbean Regional Workshop in January 2020 was the fourth and final Regional Workshop to share learning, challenges and best practices. It included 11 Public Account Committees from across the region. 11 Public Accounts Committees completed the PAC Biennial Survey.

Self-Rating Against PAC Principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principle</th>
<th>Fully Compliant</th>
<th>Mostly Compliant</th>
<th>Plans to be Compliant</th>
<th>Rarely Compliant</th>
<th>No Plans to be Compliant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Principle 1: Independent of government</td>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image3" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image4" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image5" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 2: Adequate budget</td>
<td><img src="image6" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image7" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image8" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image9" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image10" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 3: Non-partisan</td>
<td><img src="image11" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image12" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image13" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image14" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image15" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 4: Public involvement and media coverage</td>
<td><img src="image16" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image17" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image18" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image19" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image20" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 5: Common understanding</td>
<td><img src="image21" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image22" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image23" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image24" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image25" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 6: Access to all records</td>
<td><img src="image26" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image27" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image28" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image29" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image30" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 7: Power to summon</td>
<td><img src="image31" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image32" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image33" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image34" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image35" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 8: Summary report</td>
<td><img src="image36" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image37" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image38" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image39" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image40" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle 9: Robust arrangements</td>
<td><img src="image41" alt="Fully Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image42" alt="Mostly Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image43" alt="Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image44" alt="Rarely Compliant" /></td>
<td><img src="image45" alt="No Plans to be Compliant" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Breakdown of Caribbean PAC Members

- 27% Female
- 73% Male

Key Challenges faced by Public Accounts Committees in the Caribbean

- Committee: Cross-party collaboration & ensuring member availability;
- Resources: human, time, financial;
- Government: ensuring govt responses are received, govt not implementing recommendations;
- Witnesses: confirming hearing attendance, unpreparedness of witnesses and getting adequate responses to questions.

SESSION FORMATS

Each Regional Workshop consisted of a variety of interactive sessions to give delegates the opportunity to learn from peers, experts, skill-based training sessions and self-reflection to build their own skills and capacity.

EXPERT PLENARY SESSIONS

A panel of experts in a particular area each give a short presentation or opinion, before opening up the floor to questions for the panel from the audience. Moderated by a session chair, plenaries allow delegates to hear a variety of expert opinions in a short period of time, building their knowledge and allowing time for questions. Because panelists often take different perspectives and offer different solutions to problems, these sessions are great for open conversations on issues that are common to many audience members.

NETWORKING

Networking lunches, dinners and receptions offer participants an informal opportunity to make connections with their peers and explore ideas and themes of the Workshop in more detail on a one-to-one or small group basis. Networking forms the basis for ongoing exchange, learning and support following the Workshop by individuals and organisations.

KEYNOTE

A keynote address provides a new or inspiring perspective on a key theme, idea or challenge. One high-profile speaker makes a short address or contribution on their experience or insight on a central topic, setting the scene and inspiring further discussion.

SPLIT SESSION

Split sessions allow participants to explore issues in greater detail in smaller groups. The group size allows more time for interaction with expert panelists and moderators, as well as more space for individual questions, contribution and discussion. Groups can split according to their roles, allowing for valuable, focussed and relevant peer to peer exchange in a particular area.

TRAINING

Training sessions are skills based and highly interactive, where participants work in small groups with an expert facilitator or trainer. Participatory exercises develop, practice and refine key skills to build participants’ capacity to use them in real life settings.

INTERACTIVE SESSION

Interactive sessions are collaborative processes bringing together a variety of stakeholders to develop an understanding of a problem and then innovating new solutions. Interactive sessions look at a particular topic or theme in more detail, exploring different aspects through a variety of interactive activities.

PAC Relationships

How satisfied are PACs with the government response to inquiries?

How effective is the working relationship with the Supreme Audit Institution?
From 17 - 19 March 2020, CPA UK planned to hold a final Pan-Commonwealth Workshop which in Westminster, London. In light of the growing situation in the UK and around the world with regard to coronavirus (COVID-19), the difficult decision was made to cancel this Workshop. A breakdown of the delegates who had intended to attend the Workshop is provided below.

- **Caribbean:** 11 delegates
- **BIMR:** 8 delegates
- **Africa:** 16 delegates
- **Asia:** 11 delegates
- **PACIFIC:** 11 delegates
- **UK Parliament London:** 57 delegates

38 members, 57 delegates, 19 clerks

- 6 women
- 32 men
- 10 women
- 9 men

Despite the Pan-Commonwealth Workshop not taking place as planned, presentations and content that had been prepared by speakers was later captured through videos and uploaded to the CAPAC Online Portal as resources. Some of the content captured included:

**Session: Measuring effectiveness of PACs**
Dr Alice Lilly, Senior Researcher, Institute for Government
What does ‘effectiveness’ look like for different PACs across the Commonwealth?
Dr Lilly discusses:
- What effectiveness means for different committees;
- Tips on measuring effectiveness in your own committees;
- Challenges to measuring effectiveness.

**Session: Technical Training on PAC Scrutiny, Analysing Financial Information**
Larry Honeysett, Head of Financial Scrutiny Unit, House of Commons
Larry discusses:
- What financial information is and how you can break it down;
- UK PAC examples of working with financial information;
- An additional practical example case study for delegates to engage with.

**Session: Public Outreach and Engagement: Making Personal Impact**
Lilian Greenwood MP, Member for Nottingham South & Ginny Radmall, Senior Coach, Amplify Me
Lilian Greenwood MP discusses:
- The challenges of dealing with the media as a committee Chair;
- 3 top tips for engaging with the media and social media;
- Speaking on behalf of the entire committee, not just the Chair.

Ginny Radmall discusses:
- Techniques for calming your nerves before public speaking;
- How to communicate complex information simply and effectively using body language and storytelling.
ABOUT CPA UK

CPA UK’s Strategic Objectives are:

1. To strengthen parliamentary democracy
2. To link Westminster with the Commonwealth
3. To set and demonstrate high performance standards

The international Commonwealth Parliamentary Association (CPA) is the professional association of all Commonwealth parliamentarians, an active network of over 17,000 parliamentarians from 185 national, state, provincial and territorial parliaments and legislatures.

CPA UK supports and strengthens parliamentary democracy throughout the Commonwealth. We focus on key issues including women in parliament, modern slavery, financial oversight, security and trade.

Peer to peer learning is central to the way CPA UK works. CPA UK brings together UK and Commonwealth parliamentarians and officials, to share knowledge and learn from each other. We aim to improve parliamentary oversight, scrutiny and representation. CPA UK is located in, and funded by, the UK Parliament.

For more information, please visit the CPA UK website www.uk-cpa.org or the CPA UK twitter @CPA_UK.

VISION

Inclusive, representative and transparent Commonwealth Parliaments; fully effective in enforcing the accountability of the executive and representing the interests and concerns of the electorate.

PURPOSE

To learn from and strengthen Commonwealth Parliaments to deliver effective oversight, scrutiny and representation.

CPA UK is also the secretariat for the CPA British Islands and Mediterranean Region, organising activities in support of the Commonwealth Women Parliamentarians network. CPA UK also works to strengthen the Commonwealth Association of Public Accounts Committees in its core objectives.

CPA UK continues to work in partnership with a multitude of national and international organisations for mutual benefit, including the Commonwealth Secretariat, World Bank, United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), Organization of American States (OAS) and the UK Government.

COMMONWEALTH PARTNERSHIP FOR DEMOCRACY (CP4D)

The Commonwealth Partnership for Democracy (CP4D) aims to build trust in democratic institutions and support the political engagement of minorities and vulnerable groups in 18 developing countries across the Commonwealth.

The £4m two-year programme was launched at the 2018 London meeting of Commonwealth Heads of Government. It is managed by the UK Foreign and Commonwealth Office and implemented by the Westminster Foundation for Democracy in partnership with the CPA Headquarters Secretariat, CPA UK and the Commonwealth Local Government Forum.

The Pan-Commonwealth Workshop is part of a wider programme for Commonwealth Public Accounts Committees delivered by CPA UK and funded by CP4D. This Workshop brings together learning from the Regional Workshop Series, with three Workshops delivered in the Pacific region (Fiji, February 2019), the Asia region (Malaysia, August 2019) and the Caribbean (Trinidad & Tobago, January 2020).

The CAPAC programme aims to:

- Work with Commonwealth Public Accounts Committees (PACs) to promote best practice and effective scrutiny of public expenditure.
- Embed a network of Commonwealth-wide PACs with a culture of shared best practice and expertise and peer to peer learning.

For more information please contact cpauk@parliament.uk.
# AFRICA REGIONAL WORKSHOP DELEGATE LIST

**CAMEROON**  
Hon. Martin Atinda Mboni MP  
Hon. Albert Kouoh Dooh-Collins MP  
Hon. Mouyembo Rosette Julienne epse Ayayi MP  

**GHANA**  
Hon. James Klutse Avedzi MP  
Hon. Edward Kaaile-Ewola Dery MP  
Hon. Kofo Okere-Ayekum MP  
Mr Inusah Mohammed  

**KENYA**  
Hon. Beninitah Ghati, HSC MP  
Hon. Erastus Kivasu MP  
Hon. Zachary Thuku MP  
Hon. Jessica Mpingana Kafula MP  
Mr. Navin Gopall  
Ms Lucy Kimathi  
Hon. Ahmed Ibrahim MP  
Sen. Milcent Omanga MP  
Sen. Ledama Olekina MP  
Hon. Sen. Charles Kiburu  
Hon. Sen. Moses Kajwang  

**MAURITIUS**  
Hon. Marie- Aurelie Marie-joyce Perraud MP  
Hon. Sudesh Rughooobur MP  
Mr Navin Gopall  

**MOZAMBIQUE**  
Hon. Esperança Laurinda Francisco Nhuiane Bias MP  
Hon. José Manuel Samo Gudo MP  
Mrs Antonieta Alberto Muchabje  

**NAMIBIA**  
Hon.Dudu Murorua MP  
Hon. Agnes Mpingana Kafula MP  
Hon. Mike Kavekotora MP  
Mr Ivan Skywer  

**NIGERIA**  
Hon. Kingsley Chinda MP  
Mr Titus Agina  
Mr Ahmadu Abdullahi  

**SEYCHELLES**  
Hon. Jean-francois Ferrari MP  
Hon. Sebastien Pillay MP  
Mrs. Fiorette Marguerite Dufresne Monairie  

**SIERRA LEONE**  
Hon. Sengehpoh Solomon Thomas MP  
Hon. Alusine Kanneh MP  
Hon. Emilia Loloh Tongi MP  
Mr David Saffa MNA  

**THE GAMBIA**  
Hon. Muhamed Magassy NAM  
Hon. Alhagie Drammeh NAM  
Hon. Alagie Jawara NAM  
Ms Bintou Kanteh  

**UNITED KINGDOM**  
Meg Hillier MP  
Mr Dominic Stockbridge  

---

# PACIFIC REGIONAL WORKSHOP DELEGATE LIST

**AUSTRALIA: TASMANIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL**  
Hon. Ivan Dean MLC  

**AUSTRALIA: WESTERN AUSTRALIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL**  
Hon. Colin Tincknell MLC  

**AUSTRALIA: NSW LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY**  
Jonathan Elliott  

**FIJI**  
Hon. Alvick Avhikrit Maharaj MP  
Hon. Joseph Nitya Nand MP  
Hon. Vijendra Prakash MP  
Hon. Aseri Masivou Radrodro MP  
Hon. Ratu Naiqama Lalabalavu MP  

**KIRIBATI**  
Hon. Tekena Tiroa MP  
Hon. Shiu Fung Jong MP  
Hon. James Taom MP  

**NEW ZEALAND**  
Andrew Bayly MP  
Mark Patterson MP  

**NIUE**  
Hon. Florence Maureen Melekitama MP  
Hon. Crossley Tatui MP  

**SAMOA**  
Hon. Chief Faumuina Tiatia Liuga MP  
Hon. Afoa Amituanai Faleulu Mauli MP  

**SOLOMON ISLANDS**  
Peter Lokay  
Jasmine Navala Waleafea  

**TUVALU**  
Eli Lopati  

---

**SPEAKER LIST**

**AFRICA PARLIAMENTARY CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT OFFICER, NATURAL RESOURCE GOVERNANCE INSTITUTE**  
Adams Fusheini  

**TECHNICAL MANAGER, AFRICAN ORGANISATION OF ENGLISH SPEAKING SUPREME AUDIT INSTITUTIONS**  
Nonhlanhla Wbade  

---

**PACIFIC ASSOCIATION OF SUPREME AUDIT INSTITUTIONS (PASAI)**  
Eroni Vatuloka  

---

**SPEAKER LIST**

**AUDITOR GENERAL, FIJI**  
Ajay Nand  

**UNDP PACIFIC**  
Jean-Raphael Giuliani
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Delegate List</th>
<th>Delegate List</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ASIA REGIONAL WORKSHOP DELEGATE LIST</strong></td>
<td><strong>CARIBBEAN REGIONAL WORKSHOP DELEGATE LIST</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>BANGLADESH</strong> Mr. Md Abdus Shahid MP  Mr. Md Faisal Morshed</td>
<td><strong>BARBADOS</strong> Bishop Joseph Atherley MP  Hon. Lindelli Nurse MP  Ms Beverley Gibbons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HONG KONG</strong> Hon. Abraham Shek Lai-him GBS JP  Hon. Kenneth Leung  Mr Matthew Loo Sze-yuen</td>
<td><strong>BELIZE</strong> Hon. Kareem Musa MP  Hon. Julio Estap MP  Mrs Clarita Pech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MALAYSIA</strong> Hon. Dato’ Dr Noraini binti Ahmad  Hon. Tuan Wong Kah Woh  Hon. Tuan Wong Chen  Hon. Tuan Steven Choong Shiao Yoon  Hon. Tuan Wong Hon Wai  Hon. Puan Wong Shu Qi  Hon. Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Hamzah  Hon. Datuk Robert Lawson Chuat  Datuk Roosme Hamzah  Mr Ahmad Johan Mohd Afand  Mr Amisyahrizan Bin Amar Khan  Ms Siti Noor Akmar Binti Zulka</td>
<td><strong>BERMUDA</strong> Hon. Patricia Gordon-Pamplin MP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>MALDIVES</strong> Hon. Mohamed Nashiz MP  Hon. Fazul Rasheed MP  Ms. Shama Fahumy</td>
<td><strong>CAYMAN ISLANDS</strong> Hon. McKeeva Bush MP  Miss Manesa Webb</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PAKISTAN</strong> Mr Muhammad Sana Ullah Khan Masti Khel MNA  Mr Rana Tanveer Hussain MNA  Mr Qamar Sohail Lodhi</td>
<td><strong>GREENADA</strong> Hon. Anthony Botsuain MP  Senator Christopher DeAllie MP  Mr Andrew Augustine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SRI LANKA</strong> Hon. Sunil Handunnethti MP  Mr Ranjith Fernando</td>
<td><strong>GUYANA</strong> Ms Michelle Singh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNITED KINGDOM</strong> Mr Dominic Stockbridge  Mr Mark Etherton</td>
<td><strong>JAMAICA</strong> Ms Juliet Cuthbert-Flynn MP  Dr Morais Guy MP  Mr Leslie Campbell MP  Ms Rosemarie Douglas-Beckford</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TURKS &amp; CAICOS ISLANDS</strong> Hon. Akiera Missick</td>
<td><strong>MONTESERRAT</strong> Hon. Paul Lewis MP  Mrs Veronica Dorsette Hector MP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNITED KINGDOM</strong> Ms Layla Moran MP  Mr Nigel Mills MP  Dominic Stockbridge</td>
<td><strong>ST LUCIA</strong> Hon. Bradley Felix MP  Hon. Alva Baptiste MP  Mrs Esmalene Cox-Jn Louis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO** Hon. Madam Speaker Bridgid Annisette-George MP  Dr Bhoendradatt Tewarie MP  Senator Charisse Seeperd MP  Senator Wade Mark MP  Senator Amrita Deonarine MP  Mrs Ayanna Webster-Roy MP  Ms Sheranne Samuel  Ms Keiba Jacob | **SPEAKER LIST**
| **AUDITOR GENERAL OF MALAYSIA** YBhg. Dato ‘Nik Azman Nik Abdul Majid | **DAVID CHRISTOPHERSON** Former Chair and Member, Standing Committee on Public Accounts, Canada |
| **CARIBBEAN DEVELOPMENT BANK** Marlene Johnson, Operations Officer, Gender and Development  Jason Cotton, Country Economist (Barbados & Jamaica)  Wayne Elliott, Economic Research Analyst | **WORLD BANK** Mitchell O’Brien, Senior Governance Specialist |